Permaculture Design vs. Design in Agroecology. Same, same but different?

Immo Fiebrig
immo.fiebrig@coventry.ac.uk

First Agroecology Europe Forum
isara|yon | 25 – 27 October 2017, Lyon, France

Workshop 4  ●  26 October 2017  ●  10:30 - 12:00
Today’s Journey

10:30 – 11:00  Intro and short impulses (30’)

11:00 – 11:50  Open discussion (50’)

11:50 – 12:00  Wrap-up, joint recommendations, action plan for AE-Eur (10’)

Coventry University
What on earth is Permaculture?
Beyond Agroecology?

- Sustainable agriculture
- Long term, lasting culture
- (eco)systems thinking
- More than simply “organic”

* Downloaded from blog.numondo.com

https://permacultureprinciples.com/wp-content/uploads/2013/01/Holmgren_Pc_Flower.mp3
Permaculture vs Agroecology
Permaculture vs Agroecology
Permaculture vs Agroecology

Science

Practice

Movement

Agroecology
Permaculture vs Agroecology
"The very diverse incarnations..."

- Agro-ecology
  - Ecological intensification
  - Conservation agriculture
  - Permaculture
  - Regenerative agriculture
  - Eco-Agriculture
  - and many more...
  - Organic agriculture
  - Integrated pest management
  - Resource conserving agriculture

Permaculture vs Organic Gardening

see image:

Design + Permaculture
Diseño + permacultura

Design + Agroecology
Diseño + agroecología

Google: >15 Mio entries
1 Mio (Spanish)

Google: 2 Mio entries
390.000 (Spanish)
Images have been removed to avoid copyright infringement. Please revert to the indicated search strategies.

enter 'Permaculture': ecosia pictures
Images have been removed to avoid copyright infringement. Please revert to the indicated search strategies.

enter 'Permaculture + design': ecosia pictures
Images have been removed to avoid copyright infringement. Please revert to the indicated search strategies.

enter 'Diseño + permacultura': ecosia pictures
Images have been removed to avoid copyright infringement. Please revert to the indicated search strategies.

enter 'Agroecology': ecosia pictures
Images have been removed to avoid copyright infringement. Please revert to the indicated search strategies.

enter 'Agroecology + design': ecosia pictures
Images have been removed to avoid copyright infringement. Please revert to the indicated search strategies.

enter 'Agroecología + diseño': ecosia pictures
Permaculture:

Beyond sustainability
or
simply

“hippie gardening”?
The role of design in permaculture

Design
(https://en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/design)

• A decorative pattern.

• A plan or drawing produced to show the look and function or workings of a building, garment, or other object before it is made.

• Purpose or planning that exists behind an action, fact, or object.
## Comparison AE vs PC

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agroecology</th>
<th>Permaculture</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What make them different</td>
<td>What make them different</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Institutional support | Cultivate healthy food | Principles applicable beyond land management (bioconstruction, community building, health, economy, ...)
| Scientific recognition | Promotion of biodiversity | Deliberate schemes for assessment and continuous learning |
| Greater focus on agricultural production | Care of farmers | Search for other types of benefits (multifunctionality) |
| | Inspired by the principles of ecology | Analysis and holistic design |
| | Implication of society | Greater focus on social benefit |

Maria Vela Campoy, 2017
Prominent voices from permaculture:

The role of design in permaculture
Bonjour Lyon!

Graham Bell

Honorary elder of PC movement
Longest standing teacher of permaculture in the UK, since 1990

Books:
The Permaculture Way
The Permaculture Garden

Lives in oldest intentional food forest garden.

0.08 ha
16t food/ha

20 September 2017
Permaculture is a design system for creating productivity for all human needs – it started with (permanent) agriculture which grew with the realisation we needed permanent culture in everything.

It is opposed to Chemical Agriculture.

Graham Bell
Any sustainable cultivation has to be **polycultural and in 5 dimensions**

1\textsuperscript{st} and 2\textsuperscript{nd} dimension: **flat space**

3\textsuperscript{rd} dimension: **vertical space**, living soil and trees

4\textsuperscript{th} dimension: **time**
(rotational planting, different crops across the seasons, harvesting at different times)

5\textsuperscript{th} dimension: **relationships**
(with biota in the soil and plants but also between every other element of a conscious design)

Graham Bell
Images have been removed to avoid copyright infringement. Please revert to the indicated search strategies.

Richard Perkins at Ridgedale Farm, Sweden

"High quality local food producer and pioneering educational site", the northernmost permaculture farm on the planet (latitude 59°N; approx. Oslo)
Richard Perkins at Ridgedale Farm, Sweden

Regenerative Agriculture, Keyline Design, Agroforestry, Pasture based livestock enterprises, Holistic Management, No-Dig Market Gardening as well as operating our own on-farm poultry processing facility. Our foremost responsibility is regenerating our landscape, ecosystem processes and soils through resilient, replicable, scalable and profitable farm enterprises. Our secondary function is to educate, facilitate, inform and empower people into action through regenerative design, enterprise and holistic decision-making that fosters and stimulates local community, economy and resilience.

ridgedalepermaculture.com
Images have been removed to avoid copyright infringement. Please revert to the indicated search strategies.

Michael Ableman Street Farming in Vancouver
Images have been removed to avoid copyright infringement. Please revert to the indicated search strategies.

Tap o'Noth Farm, Rhyne, Aberdeenshire, Scotland
Tap o'Noth Farm, Rhyne, Aberdeenshire, Scotland

"Tap o’ Noth Farm is a small, diverse market farm situated at the foot of Tap o’ Noth hill, near the village of Rhynie in rural Aberdeenshire. We farm ecologically grown vegetables, raise free range chickens for eggs in our meadows and woodlands and have a small herd of rare breed Shetland cattle.

We deliver our produce via CSA (Community Supported Agriculture) vegetable box scheme, bringing our naturally grown produce to people within a 15 mile radius of Rhynie. We also function as a permaculture demonstration site for the Permaculture Association and offer monthly tours of our farm and ecologically designed systems."

taponothfarm.com
Images have been removed to avoid copyright infringement. Please revert to the indicated search strategies.

Tombreck Farm, Loch Tay, Killin, Scotland
Tombreck Farm, Loch Tay, Killin, Scotland

"We are looking for people to come and start their own farming and growing projects on Tombreck Farm. This could be anything from a veg box scheme, growing soft fruit, food processing, smallholdings, to a micro-dairy or raising sheep, cattle or other stock. Our long term vision is to farm as a co-operative or social enterprise. The land must be farmed organically and ecologically by adopting agri-environmental / integrated farm management systems. We want our future land workers to be able to live and work on the farm, and to enable this we hope to build new affordable housing protected by a mutual home ownership scheme from becoming second homes or holiday lets. The current farmhouse will also be available to rent for a land worker from early 2019."
Images have been removed to avoid copyright infringement. Please revert to the indicated search strategies.

Joseph Holzer's Krameterhof, Lungau, Austria
"An experimental Permaculture-project with international reputation
Krameterhof is known as a permaculture showcase thanks to its size, complex design, and diversity. For years Krameterhof has been attracting experts and nature lovers from all over Europe and even from further abroad.
We consider our farm to be a laboratory that allows us to question farming techniques and test alternatives. At the same time we follow paths of traditional farming and adapt them to present needs. Our approach might sometimes be unconventional, but is always strictly based on scientific grounds.
We are guided by responsibility and openness. It is of utmost importance that our experiments are both, joyful and environmentally sound."
Images have been removed to avoid copyright infringement. Please revert to the indicated search strategies.

La Ferme du Bec Hellouin, Normandie
La Ferme du Bec Hellouin, Normandie

"On a cultivated acreage of 1,061m\(^2\), it was possible to create year round a monthly net income between 898€ and 1,571€ depending on sales and investment levels. These incomes were generated with an average workload of 43h per week. Such economic performances demonstrated that these initiatives can be viable."

"I don't regard Permaculture and Agroecology as different things"

"Permaculture is a direction - not a destination, no one lives in a perfect permaculture world"

"My garden is so productive and at the same time a haven for wildlife"

"This is a great movement [...] we are too few [...] an estimated 2 million people have done a permaculture course, that's "only" 0.03 % of the world population."

Graham Bell
PC voice from Australia!

Rosemary Morrow

Agricultural scientist, permaculture educator

Books:
earth user's guide to TEACHING permaculture

Brings permaculture into refugee situations with extreme poverty, AIDS epidemics, desasters, working in Iraq or other war zones.

Aim: improve peoples lives
Rosemary likes functional design strategies:

1. **Sector analysis**: social, economic, ecologic looking **outside the boundaries of your property**: climate, landscape, aspects threatening the site – not just designing within your own boundaries (e.g. genetic material in your vicinity).
2. **Zoning:** some parts of land are more productive than others within a property, some of it is not good for commercial production but important for regeneration.

All land has functional and productive uses if not for people then for nature. Essentially we endanger ourselves, productivity, and the sustainability when we do not reserve land for purposes not for human use.

https://integralpermaculture.wordpress.com
3. Water harvesting, storage and cleaning; the *one* thing we have to deal with in permaculture and with climate change...either *droughts* or *floods* = WATER.
4. Perennial species: fundamental to regenerative agriculture
Permaculture vs industrial intensive agriculture

Design is unique to permaculture and is not simply planning. Where industrial agriculture plans “to plant wheat in spring” for example. Permaculture designs for multiple yields, sustainability and risk aversion. The design considers the site in its entirety not just the enterprise to be undertaken.

Rosemary Morrow
Graham Brookman's Food Forest, Australia

foodforest.com.au: The Food Forest is a 15 hectare property in Gawler where we grow over 160 varieties of organic fruit, nuts, grains, vegetables and timber. We run courses...

Images have been removed to avoid copyright infringement. Please revert to the indicated search strategies.
Robyn Francis, Djanbung Gardens, Australia

permaculture.com.au/djanbung-gardens: "Robyn Francis shares the story of transforming a 5-acre degraded compacted cow-pasture into a permaculture paradise of international renown. Since opening in 1994..."

Images have been removed to avoid copyright infringement. Please revert to the indicated search strategies.
Kadoorie Farm and Botanic Garden, Hong Kong

kfbg.org: Kadoorie Farm & Botanic Garden is involved in promoting the conservation of biodiversity in Hong Kong and in educating people about sustainable living.

Images have been removed to avoid copyright infringement. Please revert to the indicated search strategies.
Aranya's Farm, Forest Farming, India

permacultureindia.org: Permaculture is pro-nature and pro-people. At Aranya Agricultural Alternatives, we strive to empower tribal communities with special focus on women and farmers.

Images have been removed to avoid copyright infringement. Please revert to the indicated search strategies.
PC voices from the UK

Tomas Remiarz

Permaculture practitioner, consultant and researcher, Industry Associate at CAWR, Coventry University

Book: Forest Gardening in Practice

Occupation: managing a housing cooperative with three buildings and seven acres of land with orchards, meadows, vegetable garden, woodland, doing an ecorenovation with sustainable wastewater treatment and heating with wood from the land.

27 September 2017
"...to me...the boundaries between agroecology and permaculture are quite fluid..."

Like agroecology, permaculture started in an academic setting...permaculture then became very much practice focused in my eyes....with agroecology looking at the theoretical grounding...

...we are getting to the point where agroecology and permaculture are meeting in the same room again..."    Tomas Remiarz
"The task of the [permaculture] designer is to respond to the specific condition of the land and community that the farm is set in, and fulfil the needs of the users of the land....The best designers and practitioners start with the condition of the land and needs of the community, then develop patterns that respond to both and select relevant elements."

Tomas Remiarz
Organic Lea Community Growers, London

farmgarden.org: Selling to Restaurants, a practical workshop at the fantastic Organiclea Community Growing site to explore ... Chingford, London. ... Organiclea growers and professional caterers.
PC voices from the UK

Maddy Harland

Co-founder of the Permaculture Magazine and a publishing company: Permanent Publications. Set up The Sustainability Centre for training, fellow of Winchester University.

Books:
Over 80 books and 94 magazines

29 September 2017
Maddy
Permaculture is:

• Planning
• Attitude
• Approach

• including the timeline
• integrating human needs with environmental design
Permaculture design embraces:

- stacking
- create multifunctional yields
- creation of microclimates
- greater edge
- integrating crops
- utilising niches
- creativity and openness to experimentation
- a sense for limits to growth
- designing from patterns to details
PC voice from the USA

Starhawk

Born Miriam Simos, American writer, long time activist, permaculture designer and teacher grounded in spirit and social permaculture

Books:
The Empowerment Manual; 12 other titles (fiction & non-fiction)

Topics: Regenerative Culture, Earth-based spirituality, Permaculture, feminist Neopaganism, Ecofeminism.

29 September 2017
"A lot of people are moving to the term 'regenerative agriculture' instead of permaculture"...

...Permaculture's strength lies in the ethics; the principles are derived from this...

...they can be applied to living systems, urban systems or social systems...

...overlap [with agroecology]: starting from a basic ecologic understanding. Starhawk
Social permaculture...is about how the people part [of a community] works...it is about designing human systems that encourage interactions [...] and help to navigate conflicts in a relationship...to make it fruitful and exciting rather than divisive and destructive.

Starhawk
[My work is about]..."helping horizontal groups or networks work more efficiently... ...helping [them] to gain power by taking on responsibility [...] and building trust"... 

Starhawk
"I am part of a long-term community project, [that has to work with]

- minimal overall structure
- lots of individual and group autonomy
- consensus: how to run meetings and listen to the people"

Starhawk
"Dealing with the vegetables is the easy part (I know agroecologists won't agree) dealing with people is the challenge!

[...] According to Diana Leafe Christian 90% of intentional communities fail."

Starhawk
The proposal: PC & AE

Walking the road towards agroecological transition together.

Question:

What synergies could be created?
PC

Customers

Biodiversity

Stewardship

Communication

AE
Open discussion, 50'.

Acknowledgements
to all participants and event organisers,
to contributors, in particular:
Alfréd Szilágyi, Hungary (comments)
Graham Bell, UK (interview)
Rosemary Morrow, Australia (interview)
Maddy Harland, UK (interview)
Starhawk, USA (interview)
Tomas Remiarz, UK (interview)
Jay Abrahams, UK (short video)
Maria Vela Campoy, Spain (facilitation)
and an achieved 4/4 gender balance!
Highlights/key results of workshops/sessions

Permaculture Design vs Design in Agroecology. Same, same but different?

- Agroecology and permaculture share vision and origin
- Its holistic and more complex approach makes permaculture a bottom up and more engaging tool
- Risk of applying permaculture as hippie jumble with magic bullets and at the margin of reality
- The wider scope may make Permaculture less effective in creating incomes, at least short term
- Agroecology could be understood a more reliable path due to its presence in the academic field and success in creating farmers\' incomes
Proposed actions or action plans

Permaculture Design vs Design in Agroecology. Same, same but different?

- There is a need to go beyond the constrictions of language
- Synergies between both (crossfertilization) can strengthen both of them
- Agroecology could bring science, reliability and a stronger economic viability to Permaculture
- Permaculture could provide access to a wider group of people (the general public) in response not only to food systems crises in particular but to increase eco-literacy in general
Proposed actions or action plans

Permaculture Design vs Design in Agroecology. Same, same but different?

Permaculture
- Accessible to all kinds of people
- Holistic
- Peaceful activism

Agroecology
- Academy
- Economy
- Political activism

Cross-fertilisation
Synergies
Shared vision